

Options Table

Appendix A

Options Considered	Benefits	Disadvantages
<p>1. Status quo: maintain Alltwen, Godre'rgraig and Llangiwig Primary Schools, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwig) • Alltwen and Llangiwig Primary schools will remain in their current location and existing buildings, i.e. no change process for staff and pupils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environments not achievable • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwig primaries – circa.£1.9m • Godre'rgraig Primary has no permanent building – additional provision will be needed; suitable site would need to be identified • No revenue efficiencies • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>2. Establish a federation of Alltwen, Godre'rgraig and Llangiwig Primary schools, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwig) • Alltwen and Llangiwig Primary schools will remain in their current location and existing buildings i.e. no change process for staff and pupils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environments not achievable • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwig primaries circa.£1.9m • Godre'rgraig Primary has no permanent building additional provision will be needed; suitable site would need to be identified • No revenue efficiencies • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>3. Close two of the schools and transfer all pupils to the remaining school, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwig) • Alltwen or Llangiwig Primary schools would remain in their current location and existing buildings i.e. no change process for staff and pupils • Potential ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment not achievable • Limited space available at Alltwen and Llangiwig currently for additional pupils and Godre'rgraig is in a temporary building • Insufficient space to increase capacity through extending the buildings at the current schools • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwig primaries circa.£1.9m

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>4. Close one of the three schools and transfer pupils to the remaining two schools, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwg) • If Godre’rgraig Primary were the school chosen to close then this option would resolve their temporary building issue - this would also mean no build cost for Godre’rgraig • Potential ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environments not realised • Insufficient space at any one site to accommodate two additional school populations, Godre’rgraig is in a temporary building • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwg circa.£1.9m • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>5. Close Alltwen, Godre’rgraig and Llangiwg Primary schools and build a new replacement primary school on one of the existing school sites, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of the schools will remain at their current location i.e. no change process for staff and pupils of that school • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum (partially realised) • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • Ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Confined and restricted sites meaning 21st century school learning environment not fully realised, or new build not possible on site • Significant capital cost – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Additional cost of temporary accommodation to house pupils during the build process • Pupils/staff from two closing schools could feel at a disadvantage • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>6. Close Alltwen, Llangiwg and Godre’rgraig Primary schools and build a new school in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwg and Godre’rgraig establish a new ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • WG funding secured • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost £22.7m • Change process for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • Backlog maintenance for existing pool circa.£1.3m removed • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Ongoing revenue savings 	
<p>7. Close Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig Primary schools and build a new school on another site to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig Primaries, establish a new ASD provision and maintain the pool in its current location</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No viable site identified within the area • Likely to be significant capital cost (unable to estimate as no viable site identified) • WG funding not secured for a different site • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Change process for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>8. Maintain status quo for Alltwen and Llangiwig and provide a new build school for Godre'rgraig pupils in Gnoll Road, Godre'rgraig, with a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Less disruption and fear of change to the school communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alltwen and Llangiwig would remain in poor quality buildings with backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remaining circa.£1.9m • Significant capital cost (estimated between £5.5m and £9m depending on pupil numbers) – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Gnoll Road is an extremely challenging site, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised, or new build not possible on site • Revenue efficiencies not optimised • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Possible impact on Welsh medium education of new build school in the same location as existing Welsh medium school
<p>9. Refurbishment of Alltwen and Llangiwg Primaries and a new build school for Godre’rgraig pupils in Gnoll Road, Godre’rgraig with a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum for Godre’rgraig pupils • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues addressed for Alltwen and Llangiwg Primaries • Less disruption and fear of change for the Godre’rgraig community • Less fear of change for the Alltwen and Llangiwg communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whilst Alltwen and Llangiwg Primaries would have their backlog maintenance and accessibility issues addressed at circa.£1.9m, these costs are only for putting the building back into repair, and don’t allow for improving, upgrading, remodelling or extending the existing buildings to provide facilities (internally and externally) appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum; • The estimate of backlog maintenance and accessibility costs do not reflect a true market value and are likely to be higher than indicated when tendered. No funding has been secured for this type of repair work • Major logistical issues (and additional costs) associated with temporary decant, relocation and transport of Alltwen and Llangiwg pupils whilst refurbishment is being undertaken. • Significant capital cost for new build (estimated between £5.5m and £9m depending on pupil numbers) – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Gnoll Road is an extremely challenging site, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised, or new build not possible on site • Ongoing revenue costs • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education

<p>10. Build 3 new, replacement primary schools on the existing sites of Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre’rgraig Primary schools, maintain the pool in its current position, and establish a new ASD provision on one of the sites</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Less disruption and fear of change to the school communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Current schools on confined and restricted sites, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised or new build not possible on site • Likely to be significant capital cost (unable to estimate due to unknown design to fit restricted sites available) • WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Ongoing revenue costs for 3 schools • Existing Godre’rgraig site is unsafe. Godre’rgraig is in a temporary building, therefore no existing site available • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>11. Build 3 new, replacement primary schools on the existing sites of Alltwen, Llangiwig and at Gnoll Road , Godrergraig for Godre’rgraig Primary school, maintain the pool in its current position, and establish a new ASD provision on one of the sites</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Less disruption and fear of change to the school communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alltwen and Llangiwig on confined and restricted sites, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised or new build not possible on site • Likely to be significant capital cost (at Alltwen and Llangiwig - unable to estimate due to unknown design to fit restricted sites available) – WG funding not guaranteed • Significant capital cost for new build at Gnoll Road (estimated between £5.5m and £9m depending on pupil numbers) – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Gnoll Road is an extremely challenging site, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the

		<p>benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised, or new build not possible on site</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ongoing revenue costs for 3 schools • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>12. Build 2 new replacement schools, 1 for Alltwen and Llangiwig at Parc Ynysderw, and 1 at Gnoll Road , Godrergraig for Godre'rgraig Primary school, maintain the pool in its current position, and establish a new ASD provision on one of the sites</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost (estimate £11m for school 1 and £5.5m for school 2 depending on pupil numbers) - WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Ongoing revenue costs for 2 schools –these costs would be significantly higher than the proposal for one new build school, estimates indicate circa. £525k required every year to fund this model • Change process for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>13. Close Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig Primary schools and build a new bilingual school in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig, establish a new ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • WG funding secured • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed • Ongoing revenue savings • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Promotes WESP targets for increasing Welsh-medium education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost £22.7m - WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Disruption and fear of change for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • Likelihood of negative impact on existing Welsh medium schools in the area due to attraction of bilingual education in new build premises • No existing Welsh medium pupil and staff base from which to develop Welsh –medium provision

<p>14. Close Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig Primary schools, and YGG Trebannws, and build a new bilingual school in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 700 pupils (plus 170 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig, establish a new bilingual ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Existing Welsh medium pupil and staff base from which to develop Welsh –medium provision • Promotes WESP targets for increasing Welsh-medium education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost, £22.7m+, WG funding not secured (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Disruption and fear of change for the school communities involved • Additional school closure involved • YGG Trebannws has recently benefited from 'Increasing WM Provision' WG grant funding £460K which under this option would be abandoned and potentially subject to WG grant clawback if the school were to close • Additional travel time for some pupils • Possibility of negative impact on YGG Pontardawe due to attraction of bilingual education in new build premises ; however, this option could equally be unpopular with some families at YGG Trebannws, meaning YGG Pontardawe would be a more attractive offer, increasing numbers there through existing WM NPT pupils and preventing new WM growth • Increases the size of an already large school
--	---	--

<p>15. Close YGG Pontardawe, YGG Trebannws and Godre’rgraig primary schools and build a new bilingual school in in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of YGG Trebannws, YGG Pontardawe and Godre’rgraig, establish a new bilingual ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum for YGG Pontardawe , YGG Trebannws and Godre’rgraig • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed for YGG Pontardawe and YGG Trebannws • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Existing Welsh medium pupil and staff base from which to develop Welsh –medium provision • Promotes WESP targets for increasing Welsh-medium education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost, £22.7m+, WG funding not secured (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Disruption and fear of change for the school communities involved • YGG Pontardawe and YGG Trebannws have recently benefited from ‘Increasing WM Provision’ WG grant funding of circa £2.65m which under this option would be abandoned and potentially subject to WG grant clawback if the school were to close • Additional travel time for some pupils • Alltwen and Llangiwig would not benefit from 21st century educational facilities and would remain in existing buildings • Funding not available for improving facilities in EM schools through the ‘Increasing WM Provision’ WG grant funding , therefore backlog maintenance and accessibility costs for Alltwen and Llangiwig would remain.
---	--	--